



**CITY COUNCIL**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU  
530 SOUTH KING STREET, ROOM 202  
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813-3065  
TELEPHONE: (808) 768-5010 • FAX: (808) 768-5011

**CLEAN WATER AND NATURAL LANDS COMMISSION**

Chair: Benton Pang, Vice-chair: Kathleen Pahinui

Members: Jean Campbell, Jonathan Deenik, Shad Kane, Annette Kaohelauii,  
Jocelyn Macadangdang-Doane, David Penn, Marjorie Ziegler

December 26, 2013

The Honorable Ernest Martin  
Chair, City Council  
City & County of Honolulu  
Honolulu Hale  
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

RECEIVED  
CITY CLERK  
& C OF HONOLULU  
2014 MAR -4 AM 9:02

Subject: Clean Water Natural Lands Commission Annual Recommendations

Dear Chair Martin:

Aloha. The Clean Water and Natural Lands Commission respectfully submits its recommendations to the City Council for inclusion in the City's Fiscal Year 2014-2015 budget. The Commission strongly recommends funding in the amounts requested. Please see Attachment 1 for the list of projects, the final score, and amounts requested.

The application process opened on July 1, 2013. Applications were due by 4:00 p.m. on September 1, 2013. The application was available on the Commission's website and announcements were sent to the public via the City's Neighborhood Board system, the website's interested parties list, and a press release. After receiving the applications, the Commissioners conducted site visits in small groups to each project. On October 18, the Commission held a 3 ½ hour meeting to hear presentations from each of the applicants and to receive public testimony. The Commission also received written testimony, all of which is available on the City's Docushare website.

At the Commission's meeting on November 8, 2013, the Commission reviewed and finalized its recommendations. Each Commissioner scored projects based on the 7 criteria as listed in the application, which reflected the Council's directives as listed in Resolution 07-355, CD1). One commissioner could not make this "ranking meeting" and voluntarily chose to refrain from submitting their score. Therefore, the scoring reflects participation from 8 of the 9 commissioners. Also included with this letter are specific comments from commissioners on each of the projects (see Attachment 2).

The Honorable Ernest Martin  
Page Two  
December 26, 2013

On behalf of the Commission, I would like to extend a heartfelt Aloha and Mahalo to the Council for the privilege to serve on this Commission. We are available at any time to answer any questions the Council may have on the recommendation or the process.

Kind regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Benton Pang", with a checkmark at the end.

Benton Pang, Chairperson

cc: CWNLC Commissioners

Attachments: 1) FY 2014-2015 Ranking & Tally Chart  
2) CWNLC Commissioners' Comments

# Attachment I

## FY 2014-2015 Ranking & Tally

Final Rank	Project name & location	Applicant	Average matrix score <sup>1</sup>	Average Other Factors Rank <sup>2</sup>	Total project cost <sup>3</sup> (acreage)	Amount requested (% total)	Amount recommended (% total)
1	'Aina Haina Nature Preserve Expansion, Wailupe	Trust for Public Land & The C&C of Honolulu	28	18	\$4,056,000 (9.532) <sup>4</sup>	\$2,311,000 (57%)	\$2,311,000 (57%)
2	Hakipu'u Lo'i Kalo, Hakipu'u, Ko'olaupoko	Trust for Public Land & Ka Huli O Hāloa	27	16	\$1,037,000 (1.5)	\$650,000 (63%)	\$650,000 (63%)
3/4 (tie)	Ho'oulu Ola, Ki'oi and Pohaka'a, Kalihi	Trust for Public Land & Kōkua Kalihi Valley Comprehensive Family Services	25	17	\$1,839,000 (11.44)	\$900,000 (49%)	\$900,000 (49%)
3/4 (tie)	Pūpūkea Ranch, Pūpūkea	Hawaiian Islands Land Trust	25	17	\$3,600,000 (212.595)	\$1,800,000 (25%)	\$1,800,000 (25%)

<sup>1</sup> The Matrix score total is based on each of the seven categories/purposes of the fund (5 possible points in each): 35 points = maximum.

<sup>2</sup> Other Factors score is based on a scale of: 5 points = high priority, 3 points = medium priority, 1 point = low priority.

<sup>3</sup> Information provided by applicant, considering all needed and matching funds.

<sup>4</sup> Landowner is deciding whether to sell full 9.5-acre parcel or subdivide and sell only 9 acres and keep .5-acre parcel to build permitted 2 homes.

Attachment 2  
CLEAN WATER AND NATURAL LANDS COMMISSION  
FY 2014-2015 Ranking & Tally  
PROJECT COMMENTS By COMMISSIONERS

**'Aina Haina Nature Preserve**

This project would protect an area that, while somewhat small in geographic size, includes a potentially large repository of previously unstudied cultural sites. This site also provides the best public access to the existing 'Aina Haina Nature Preserve further mauka in the valley, which access is important for the both the public and emergency purposes. Its streamside location also contributes to watershed protection. **JC**

The Wailupe project is a strong candidate for CWNL funding because it will ensure public and other access to the City's 'Aina Haina Nature Preserve and state forested land, which provides habitat for native and endangered species. The project will also help protect watershed, facilitate outdoor recreation, and help avoid erosion and rock slides in this area. **MZ**

Once again, I was able to participate in the site visit to this property and the surrounding City owned nature preserve. In hindsight, it is unfortunate that this parcel was not included in the original purchase by the City and County for landslide mitigation which resulted in the creation of the 'Aina Haina Nature Preserve. The parcel, at the beginning of an ancient Hawaiian trail is heavily used by members of the community. It should be purchased just to ensure access to the trail, but in addition, trail access is important to scientists, firefighters, and the hiking community.

Wailupe Stream is the only un-channelized natural stream in East O'ahu. From what I have seen and learned about the historic and archeological values of this area, I strongly agree that this parcel should be purchased with funds from the Clean Water Natural Lands Fund. **AK**

The proposed expansion is critically important to preserving the physical and spiritual integrity of the larger cultural landscape, including unusual and intriguing pōhaku that may be associated with nearby stream/freshwater features. Enlarging the existing City park would provide additional protection for significant habitat of the O'ahu 'Elepaio (an endangered native forest bird that lives only on O'ahu) and secure public access to public land for recreation, education, and forest management.

Additional Factors/Consistency with City Priorities – The proposed acquisition appears to fulfill the historic legislative intent of the City Council, while addressing administration Priority #4, Re-establishing Pride in our City Parks (See Mayor Caldwell Delivers Inaugural State of the City Address, *available at* <https://www1.honolulu.gov/mayor/stateofthecity130403.pdf>). It also ranked high for urgency of acquisition. **DP**

### **Hakipu'u Lo'i Kalo: Ka Huli o Hāloa**

...fairly small in geographic scope, this project seeks to protect important cultural agricultural resources for educational purposes. JC

The Hakipu'u project will ensure public access to Mōli'i Fishpond and the ocean, as well as provide an outdoor classroom for Native Hawaiian and other students and accommodate Native Hawaiian practitioners. The applicant and its partner are eager to take care of this land for future generations. MZ

As a former windward O'ahu resident of 40 years, I am very familiar with the area in Hakipu'u and its cultural history. I am very much in favor of approving the funding for purchase of this parcel. The Ka Huli O Hāloa proposal satisfies several of the priorities in Resolution 07-355 CD1 including the priority for preservation of historic or culturally important land areas and sites, and the public outdoor recreation and education, including access to such opportunities.

I am hoping for a favorable vote from the Council to fund this purchase. The proposal has such great potential to preserve a valuable agricultural and Hawaiian cultural way of life. AK

I gave Ka Huli O Hāloa the lowest score as compared to the other 3 although still reasonably high because it is an important cultural project. It just seems to focus on a smaller effort rather than the greatest good for the greatest number of people. In a long term effort it does however I see our mission as one of an immediate nature. SK

The lo'i kalo (taro pondfield) is a carefully-engineered wetland that preserves water quality; provides flood protection; contributes to local food security; and sustains traditional and customary Hawaiian cultural beliefs, values, and practices. Use of the property as a public charter school learning laboratory would create important opportunities for education and outdoor recreation.

**Additional Factors/Urgency of Acquisition** – The situation appears to be of utmost urgency for the landowner (financial) and the Hakipu'u community (preservation). Under existing zoning, it may be possible for a new owner to destroy the ancestral lo'i and mala (garden) in order to expand and intensify other permitted uses. Also, a new owner may attempt to restrict existing access to Mōli'i Loko I'a (fishpond) and Kāne'ohe Bay. DP

### **Kōkua Kalihi Valley**

This group has done fantastic things for the Kalihi community on the property they currently have through their various programs. Expanding their land base to the Burmeister property would help them to expand their programs and also reclaim a piece of land that has been used in unfortunate ways for many years. This property would

allow the group to increase its studies and expand its cultivation of community health and wellness and protect additional watershed forest. **JK**

The Kōkua Valley project is a wonderful opportunity to build on an existing land- and culture-based program led by Kōkua Kalihi Valley. Adding the mauka parcel will result in a positive constructive use of the land, protection of watershed, reforestation, and outdoor education and recreation that are compatible with the ongoing program. **MZ**

I personally visited the site of the Ho'ōlū Ola proposal in Kalihi Valley and feel that this proposal should be funded. The acquisition will meet several of the priorities for the Clean Water and Natural Lands Resolution 07-355 CD1; namely the protection of watershed lands to preserve water quality.

We were hosted by the Ho'ōlū 'Āina project staff, so had an opportunity to see what Kōkua Kalihi Valley had already done with clearing that parcel of land, planting of garden plots, involvement of the youth in the community and the sharing with the greater community made the possibility of this project very exciting for me. I would urge you to approve the purchase of this property so that restoration of the land can proceed. **AK**

I am a big supporter of any program that focuses on children in depressed areas. I grew up in Kalihi and very familiar with Kam IV Housing and Kūhiō Park Terrace. The only thing I know about Kalihi Valley as I was growing up was from a distance. I wish there were programs such as this when I was growing up. These are the kind of programs that shape children lives and make them contributing members of society. **SK**

The proposed purchase would expand a compelling social initiative to engage the community in healing neglected and abused land, while building local self-reliance. The land is close to urban Honolulu and would provide important mountain access and learning experiences for neighboring families.

Additional Factors/Geographic Diversity – This is the first application that we have received for a real estate purchase in Council District 6. It also ranked high for matching funds (>50% contributed, pledged, application pending). **DP**

#### **Pūpūkea/Pu'u o Mahuka**

This project contributes a large amount of land to agriculture on the north shore. It would help to protect the Pu'u o Mahuka heiau, an important cultural site which is open to the public. It will also protect the cliff top from development, preserving views across a large area of the north shore. This project should also be commended for the very collaborative approach to its funding, utilizing land owner contributions, as well as federal, state and county sources. **JC**

The Pūpūkea project will add to the protected acreage for agriculture on the North Shore, including projects previously supported by the CWNL Fund, and I am impressed by the

community's efforts to protect as much open space and agricultural land as possible in the region. **MZ**

I strongly feel that match funding for the purchase of the conservation easement for this parcel is very critical to the provision of a buffer zone for the nearby Pu'u O Mahuka Heiau. This purchase would also protect many of the criteria outlined in the formation of the Clean Water Natural Lands Fund, such as protection of significant habitats or ecosystems, conservation of land in order to reduce erosion, floods, landslides or runoff, etc. and acquisition of public access to public land and open space.

I would urge this Council to approve the funding for this project as it meets so many of the criteria for purchase of property using this fund. **AZ**

Another excellent project for all that it does. It is the preservation of a significant historic cultural site and a focus on young people and the small farmer with respect to living a subsistence lifestyle. Support for local small business and less dependence on outside resources. The only negative aspect of this project is my concern on what horses can do to the environment. I used to own and ride horses and know the destruction they can do to a landscape in terms of environmental erosion. It all depends on the trail rides by the owner and trail maintenance. All too often some become more concerned with revenue and less on the cost of maintenance. **SK**

The proposed conservation easement is part of a broader, coordinated, multi-party effort to connect preservation actions throughout Pūpūkea and across the North Shore. The easement would limit the subdivision of the ranch to two parcels and implement a stringent cap on the allowable area of impervious surface upon each parcel, thus preserving water quality and water supply and providing flood protection.

Additional Factors/Matching – Receiving a timely commitment from the City would secure major funding from reliable federal sources (U.S. Department of Agriculture). **DP**

Commissioners:

JC-Jean Campbell

SK-Shad Kane

AK-Annette Kaohelauii

DP-Dave Penn

MZ-Marjorie Ziegler